

**February 25, 2020**

Chairman Lauryn Bayliff called the meeting of the Tipp City Restoration and Architectural Board of Review to order on Tuesday, February 25, 2020 at 7:37 p.m. Other Board members in attendance included: Ralph Brown, Heather Wendel, and Gregory Kussman. Also in attendance were City Planner/Zoning Administrator Colin Carville, Board Secretary Laura Tobias, and Notary Kelly Rowlands.

Citizens in attendance: Lisa Santucci and Elaine Stefkovich.

#### Absence

Ms. Bayliff announced that Ms. Lawson and Ms. Group did not contact anyone to notify them of their absence.

#### Oath of Office

Notary Kelly Rowlands administered the Oath of Office to returning Board Member Lauryn Bayliff.

#### Minutes

Chairman Bayliff asked for discussion. Being no further discussion, Ms. Wendel **moved to approve the January 28, 2020 meeting minutes as written**, seconded by Mr. Brown. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Wendel, Brown, Kussman. Nays: None. Ms. Bayliff abstained from the vote.

#### Chairman's Introduction

Chairman Bayliff explained Board procedure to all present to include the order of business; the appeal process; citizens wishing to speak for or against a request; and the acquisition of all required permits upon any approval.

#### Citizens Comments Not on the Agenda

There were none.

#### New Business

**Lisa Santucci – 11 East Main Street – Tipp City Public Library – Lot: IL 27** – The applicant seeks an approved Certificate of Appropriateness for the painting of a mural in the alleyway between the Tipp City Public Library and Coldwater Café. The mural will be on the wall of the Tipp City Public Library. **Zoning District:** CC/RA – Community Center/Old Tippecanoe City Restoration and Architectural District **Zoning Code Section(s):** § 154.05 (C)

Mr. Carville explained the applicant seeks approval from the Restoration & Architectural Board of Review for a mural on the Tipp City Public Library. The applicant will be pursuing quotes from local artists to complete the project. The mural will be painted using outdoor acrylic gloss paint. The applicant hopes to have the mural on the back portion of the alley encompassing from the side library doorway to the back of the building. The space is roughly 37 feet and hardly visible from Main Street. The applicant is willing to adjust the size of the mural to accommodate the board. The hope of this mural is to attract more people to downtown while beautifying a blank space. Staff notes that cities have had success with murals in creating engagement and interest within downtowns. Staff notes that the applicant has not provided the final design of what the mural will look like. The applicant hopes to do a large unveiling of the design to generate publicity for Downtown Tipp City. In lieu of the final drawing, the applicant has provided multiple photos of where she drew her inspiration.

Mr. Carville added that Ms. Santucci has received approval from Nick Hoover, the Owner of Coldwater Café, which is the business next door.

**February 25, 2020**

Mr. Carville attached excerpts on Paint and Color as well as Ornamentation from the Design Manual.

Excerpts from the Design Manual on Paint & Ornamentation

**Paint and Color**

Paint colors varied through history, not only with fashions, but also because of available materials. Wherever possible, paint colors appropriate to the style and period of the particular building should be used. Ideally, paint color research should be conducted on your building to determine the original color. Building color has a greater visual impact than any other exterior architectural feature. This refers not only to exterior paint, but also to roof colors and colors for such items as window sashes, doors, and ornamentation.

Choice of color is a matter of personal preference. In the case of historic buildings, however, certain colors are more appropriate to a building's forms, style and setting than others. A balance must be struck between existing use of colors, the desires of property owners to use various colors and the limitation of color use. The end result of a project involving color choice should be compatible with the area's character and with colors used in nearby buildings.

Original paint colors for a building should be researched as a starting point. The book, *A Century of Color*, by Roger Moss, has color plates of similar types of houses to those found in Tipp City. Determine what combination of colors was used, in what locations, and how many colors were used. It is always recommended that the first choice of paint color be a return to whatever the original color(s) were used on the subject building or architectural style. You can sometimes find out what the original color of your house by scraping away layers of paint in an inconspicuous spot. The bottom layer may be the primer color and the layer on top of that, the original color. A layer of dirt between bare brick and the first paint layer indicate that the brick was not originally painted. Body, trim, shutters and doors may have been painted different colors, so you should check these areas as well.

If original colors will not be used, choose paint colors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building. For late 19th century buildings, contrasting colors may be appropriate, but avoid too many colors on one building. The simpler the building design, the fewer colors should be used. On commercial buildings, the color selected for the storefront is usually repeated on the upper facade details such as friezes, cornices and window sash. A color appropriate as an accent or trim color may be entirely inappropriate on the body of a wall. Gloss black paint could be acceptable for the trim on an early 20th century building, for example, but would be prohibited on its siding.

**February 25, 2020**

In general, do not paint surfaces that have never been painted (e.g. foundations and steps). For example, stone surfaces were almost never painted (although brick often was during the 19th century). Painting stone can affect its texture and surface appearance, as well as lead to possible moisture problems by trapping moisture.

If you are repainting a building the same color(s) for the purposes of maintenance, you will not need a COA for painting. If you are proposing to change any colors of any element of the building (siding, trim, roof, etc.), a COA will be required but may be initially reviewed by staff in a shorter review period. Please refer to the Tipp City Zoning Code for information on the review procedure and criteria.

#### Standards and Guidelines for Paints and Colors

- 1) It is not necessary to paint a building in its original colors. However, an applicant is encouraged to paint buildings in historically accurate colors. The Tipp City Community and Economic Development Department maintains information and references to assist in the selection of colors in addition to the guidelines and standards of this section.

The colors applied to any building should be selected from colors available at the time the building was built and considered appropriate for the original style and design.

The colors should be applied to enhance the design of the structure and in a manner originally intended.

### **ORNAMENTATION**

Tipp City has many fine structures displaying a variety of architectural styles. Each architectural era or style has ornamentation that gives it a unique identity and detail. The variety of materials, patterns and techniques utilized gives each building its personality. These design elements make an important contribution to the building's historical significance.

For the purposes of this document, ornamentation includes the variety of brackets, porch elements, columns, cornices, window and door trim, decorative shingles and brickwork used on the house.

#### ***Standards and Guidelines for Ornamentation***

- 1) Any original ornamentation shall be maintained and preserved to the maximum extent feasible.
- 2) When restoring or working on a historic building, property owners are encouraged to restore any ornamentation that may have been removed previously.

**February 25, 2020**

- 3) Ornamentation shall not be added to a building if such ornamentation is not typically found on the buildings of the applicable architectural style or era.
- 4) If any ornamentation has to be replaced, the new or refurbished piece should match the original in size, shape, design, material etc., to the the maximum extent feasible.

Ms. Lisa Santucci, 426 South Third Street, Tipp City, Ohio approached the dais.

Ms. Santucci reminded the Board that about a year and a half ago when the Board approved the alley, her idea to paint the back half of the building was born. She wants to seek an artist in residence to paint original artwork. Murals where people come to take pictures is a growing social experiment. She used the angel wings in Nashville as an example and added that West Milton has a nonprofit called Project Revival that is raising money to paint murals on some of their downtown buildings.

Ms. Santucci stated there is an Archival Sealant that can be put over the mural to protect the paint, which would allow the library mural to avoid the same damage that has occurred to the Gem City mural.

Mr. Brown asked what Ms. Santucci's position with the library is, and who owns the building. Ms. Santucci stated she is the Director and, in a sense, she is the owner of the building. She is bonded, and she is required to protect the building. Since the library owns the building, she is considered the owner since she is the Director.

Ms. Bayliff asked what the age of the library building is. Ms. Santucci stated the building was built in 1962, and while it is not a historic building, it is in the Historic District. The library is run by a seven-member board. All are in agreement to move forward with the mural.

Ms. Bayliff stated there is nothing in the City's code that directly addresses murals. Her concerns are that the Board traditionally does not recommend painting brick because it causes deterioration, and she also stated this is not reversible, because once you paint brick, it cannot be reversed.

Mr. Brown asked if something could be painted and then attached to the brick. Ms. Santucci mentioned that vandalism on the brick in years past has been removed. Mr. Brown stated vandalism is a lot easier to remove than a mural. Ms. Santucci agreed. Ms. Santucci said she has not considered something to attach to the brick because that would be considered an addition to the building. Ms. Santucci asked what type of material they would suggest. Mr. Kussman stated if something were attached to the building, you would have to build some sort of structure or frame for it to protect it from weather.

Ms. Santucci showed the Board exactly where the mural would be located. She explained it is from the telephone pole, back to the parking lot. She stated the concept is something that is very relatable and identifiable to Tipp City. She believes people would seek this mural to have their picture taken in front of it. Ms. Santucci plans to write a grant to get funding and the community would participate by selecting some of the words that would be painted on the mural.

Mr. Brown stated he would prefer to see something added instead of actual painting of brick.

Mr. Kussman is concerned that the Board will set a precedent, and then other buildings will want to paint murals on their brick.

**February 25, 2020**

Ms. Wendel stated she really liked the idea and is more inclined to be okay with it since it is toward the rear of the building and that section is not historical.

Ms. Bayliff discussed historical significance.

Ms. Santucci explained the building has three sections: one section was built in the early 1960's, one section was built in the early 1990's, and the back section was built in 2016. She stated that Mr. Eggleston told her the building was not historic. She clarified for Ms. Bayliff that nothing from the original building has been changed. There was an addition to the east side, and then an addition to the back. The brick was matched to the original building.

Ms. Wendel questioned if there was a brick sealant that the brick could be treated with prior to painting the mural. Mr. Carville added that, according to his research, paint has come a long way to prevent deterioration.

Ms. Santucci noted that the mural would be painted on the area of the building that was added in 1991.

Mr. Kussman pointed out that the mural isn't visible from a main road. Ms. Santucci agreed and said the outdoor furniture in the alley will be placed outside on April 1<sup>st</sup>. Once all the furniture and umbrellas are out, she expects you will not be able to see the mural from Main Street.

Mr. Carville asked if there are any plans to add lighting. Ms. Santucci said no, there is already lighting there.

Mr. Brown stated he still has concerns about what happens in the future, when Ms. Santucci has moved on. Ms. Santucci asked what happens to the Gem City mural in the future. Mr. Brown responded that the Gem City mural would not be approved if the mural were requested today. Ms. Santucci asked if the board would consider a proclamation from the Library's Board of Trustees stating that they would maintain it. Ms. Brown stated he loves the idea, but would prefer that the brick does not get painted at all.

Ms. Wendel said that murals are very common now, and asked if there is an outdoor canvas that could be used.

Ms. Bayliff questioned if a mural that is attached to the brick would be considered a sign. Ms. Santucci mentioned she had spoken with Matt Spring about that concern and he said the Guidelines are very gray. Mr. Carville clarified signs are approved administratively. Ms. Santucci voiced her concern about the mural becoming a sign or an addition to the building.

Ms. Bayliff said she is struggling with where a mural fits into the code.

Mr. Kussman added that a mural in the Historic District is different than the mural that was painted on Warrior Racing located near the highway. Mr. Kussman loves the idea and feels that if you pick the right design, it'll be there for a long time. If it is done the right way with the right product, it'll be ok. He complimented the alleyway and what has been done with it thus far. Ms. Santucci stated the alleyway brings people to our Historic Downtown.

Ms. Bayliff commented that both options presented, a mural painted on the brick or a mural attached to the brick, create some effects to the building. She added she isn't concerned about the content. Ms.

**February 25, 2020**

Santucci pointed out the drawings included in the Board's packet of information are murals from other libraries. Ms. Bayliff stated she would like to amend a Certificate of Appropriateness to take steps in order to prevent deterioration of the brick.

Ms. Santucci explained the brick will not be completely whitewashed, it is an artist painting a selected amount of information, such as words and a book, in a way that someone can come and take a picture in front of it.

Mr. Kussman asked how large the mural will be. Ms. Santucci answered the mural is 37 lineal feet. She explained that it is less than half of the entire length of the alley. She used a picture of the building to point out the area that will be painted and clarified the only part of the building that the mural will be painted on is the section that was built in 1991. Ms. Bayliff said that section of the building is not considered historical.

Ms. Santucci explained the entire building is 93.5 feet long.

Ms. Bayliff stated she isn't concerned about setting a precedent since that section of the library was built in the 1990's. She is still concerned about deterioration of the brick. Ms. Santucci stated she would research a sealant.

Mr. Brown said if the Board is considering making an amendment for a sealant to prevent the deterioration of the brick, he would prefer to hear information about what will be done to protect the brick prior to a vote. He would like to learn the process before the Board makes a decision.

Ms. Bayliff suggested they table the vote until more information is obtained.

Ms. Wendel inquired about seeing the design. Ms. Santucci said she would like to keep that confidential. Ms. Bayliff asked when she would reveal the design. Ms. Santucci stated she is applying for a grant in March from the Tipp Foundation, but she said she would delay the application if needed. She added the grant would cover the cost of hiring an artist. Ms. Santucci offered to share the concept of the mural, but she is concerned that if she shares her idea, someone else will take the idea for the mural. Ms. Bayliff asked if the entire wall would be covered with paint. Ms. Santucci clarified the mural would not have a background that is completely painted. It would just be different art items painted on the brick.

Mr. Brown stated he is concerned that owners of other newer buildings in the Historic District, such as Phil Cox, will want to paint murals because the library was authorized to. Ms. Bayliff disagreed. She stated the Board has a lot of reasons to validate why it is acceptable for the library.

Ms. Bayliff concluded the Board is looking for information stating the products that are going to be used, whether it is a primer, a sealant, or even the paint itself, would not cause deterioration of the brick.

The Board Members suggested different companies to get further information from.

Mr. Kussman asked if anyone was going to be allowed to see it before it is painted on the wall. Ms. Santucci said that no one would see it, unless she can trademark it.

**February 25, 2020**

Chairman Bayliff asked for further discussion. There being none, Mr. Brown **moved to table the vote until March 24, 2020**, seconded by Mr. Kussman. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Brown, Kussman, Bayliff, Wendel. Nays: None.

Old Business

There was none.

Miscellaneous Business

There was none.

Adjournment

Chairman Bayliff asked for further discussion or comments. There being none, Ms. Wendel **moved for adjournment**, seconded by Mr. Brown and unanimously approved. **Motion carried.** Meeting adjourned at 8:20 p.m.

ATTEST:

  
Board Secretary

APPROVED:

